

Dobson ABC Board

Performance Audit Report



Alcoholic Beverage Control Commission
400 East Tryon Road, Raleigh, NC 27610
p: 919-779-0700 | f: 919-661-5927 | <http://abc.nc.gov>



ABC
COMMISSION
NORTH CAROLINA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABC Commission Statement	3
Objective, Purpose & Background Information	4
Financial Analysis, Observations & Findings	6
Recommended Actions & Additional Considerations	13-14
<i>Appendix A – Dobson ABC Board Response Letter</i>	<i>15</i>



ABC

COMMISSION
NORTH CAROLINA

Alcoholic Beverage Control

CHAIRMAN:
Hank Bauer

COMMISSIONER:
Norman A. Mitchell, Sr.
Charlotte

Deputy Commissioner:
Mike DeSilva

LOCATION:
400 East Tryon Road
Raleigh NC 27610

MAILING:
4307 Mail Service Center
Raleigh NC 27699-4307

PHONE: (919) 779-0700
<http://abc.nc.gov/>

June 24, 2023

Dobson ABC Board
Ellery Golding, Chair
816 E. Atkins St
Dobson, NC 27017

Chairperson Golding,

On the following pages, you will find the performance audit report conducted by the staff of the ABC Commission reviewing the operations of the Dobson ABC Board. The report consists of an overview of the objectives & background summary, financial analysis and findings, and a summary of actions recommended based upon your board's performance and related findings. Additional considerations are listed as well to provide further guidance and enhance awareness to promote ABC board success.

Please reach out if you have any questions or require assistance in implementing any of the statute requirements, Commission rules, or other recommendations included in the report. On behalf of the North Carolina ABC Commission, I thank you and your staff for your assistance and cooperation in conducting this periodic review. We appreciate the continued efforts by your board to comply with the performance standards, as well as the board's commitment to increase profitability and reduce expenses.

If we can be of assistance in the future, please do not hesitate to reach out to the Commission staff.

Respectfully,

Michael DeSilva
Deputy Commissioner

OBJECTIVE, PURPOSE & BACKGROUND INFORMATION

In addition to regular and special financial audits, G.S. 18B-705(a) authorizes the NC ABC Commission to conduct performance audits of all local ABC boards in the state. Performance audits are examinations of existing operating policies, practices, controls, and activities to determine those areas in which there may be a need for improvement.

The audits are designed to ensure that all local ABC Boards comply with established performance standards pursuant to G.S. 18B-203(a)(20). The audit's scope addresses compliance with ABC laws and rules, store appearance, operating efficiency, solvency, and customer service.

To achieve the objectives of the audit, auditors:

- Review applicable General Statutes, ABC Commission Rules, and Administrative Policies
- Review applicable reports and studies of ABC Boards with similar size and geography
- Verify compliance with Commission and Board policies
- Verify results of previous performance audit recommendations
- Review ABC Board annual independent financial audits
- Review ABC Board reporting and documentation reports
- Visit the store(s)
- Interview key ABC Board personnel

Dobson, NC is found in Surry County and is the county seat. In 1878, Tabitha Ann Holton was the first licensed female lawyer in the southern U.S. and practiced law here from 1878-1886. The largest winery in the state known as Shelton Vineyards is found here. Dobson serves as a gateway to the Blue Ridge Mountains and the Blue Ridge Parkway. In 2020, the town's population per the Census was approximately 1,400 residents which was virtually unchanged since 2010.

Chapter 438 of the 1971 Session Laws authorized the Town of Dobson to hold an election for an ABC store. The referendum was held March 29, 1975, and the vote passed 260 to 164. The first retail sales occurred on July 1, 1975. A mixed beverage referendum occurred August 9, 2011, and it passed. *Currently, the Town of Dobson appoints a chairperson and two (2) additional board members to serve on the ABC board.*

The Dobson ABC Board currently operates one (1) retail store. The board staffs four (4) total personnel. These include two (2) full-time employees and two (2) part-time personnel. The general manager is responsible for the daily store operations including supervising personnel, inventory management, and various retail functions. The general manager also serves as the finance officer and provides the board with fiscal management, administrative support, and oversees routine operations of the ABC stores. Sales associate responsibilities include selling products, daily stocking, and floor upkeep & maintenance.

The last performance audit for the Dobson ABC Board occurred in 2011. The Commission audit serves as a continuous way to provide local boards with information and best practices that target areas for improvement.



OPERATIONAL OBSERVATIONS, FINDINGS, REQUIRED ACTIONS, & RECOMMENDATIONS

On Wednesday, April 12, 2023, ABC Board Program Analyst Quinn Woolard, visited the Dobson ABC Board and interviewed Jon Bledsoe (General Manager & Finance Officer). Below is a financial analysis followed by operation observations, findings, and recommendations related to the performance audit.

FINANCIAL ANALYSIS

PROFIT PERCENTAGE TO SALES & OPERATING COST RATIO

In fiscal year (FY) 2021-2022, the Dobson ABC Board had a profit percentage to sales of 8.01%. The NC ABC Commission profit to sales standards for ABC Boards with gross sales less than \$2M is 5.0%. The Dobson ABC Board's gross sales totaled \$1,032,381, which was a 2.01% decrease from the previous fiscal year.

The operating cost ratio for the Dobson ABC Board was .66 in FY 2021-2022. The NC ABC Commission standard for ABC Boards with one or two stores and mixed beverage sales is .73 or less.

Thus, the Dobson ABC Board met both the profitability standard and the operating cost standard set by the NC ABC Commission. Below is a chart showing gross profit on sales and income from operations for the previous two years.

	FY 2021-2022	FY 2020-2021
Gross Profit on Sales	\$255,161	\$251,291
Income from Operations	\$82,665	\$48,491

Factors affecting profitability and cost include:

- Surrounding areas with other ABC Boards operating stores within an approximate ten to fifteen (10-15) mile range of Dobson ABC: Mount Airy ABC and Yadkin Valley ABC (Elkin) each operating one store within range, and also located in Surry County.
- An ABC Board's average cost of goods sold (COGS) is between 52% & 54% per year. The Dobson ABC Board's cost of goods sold was approximately **52.7%** in FY 2021-2022.
 - *Mixed beverage sales were roughly 1.5% of total sales in FY-2022, and there are currently three (3) mixed beverage customers.*

BUDGET ANALYSIS

	FY 2021-2022 Budget Projections	FY2021-2022 Actual	Variance	Variance %
Sales	\$1,010,000	\$1,032,381	\$22,381	2.2%
Revenue over or (under)				
Expenditures		\$19,279		

In reviewing the budget to actual analysis of the FY 2021-2022 financial audit, actual sales revenues were over budgeted projections by 2.2%. In addition, revenue exceeded expenditures by \$19,279 and the net income change during the fiscal year was \$46,861. *The board's collective net position on June 30, 2022, was around \$300k; the net position has steadily increased over the last five (5) fiscal years, and the FY-2022 figure reflects the board's highest overall net position during the five-year period.*

DISTRIBUTIONS

G.S. 18B-805 (b) requires the board to pay from gross receipts, all expenses, excise, and rehabilitation taxes. G.S. 18B-805(c)(2) requires the board to *typically* distribute at least five percent (5%) of applicable gross receipts to law enforcement and *typically* at least seven percent (7%) for alcohol education. *Before assigning these percentage distributions, G.S. 18B-805(c)(1) requires the board to first make a minimum quarterly distribution of the 3.5% markup & relevant bottle charges to certain county/municipal recipients. Some of these distribution percentages are designated by an official local enabling act (and thus distribution requirements and recipients are subject to vary).*

In FY 2021-2022, Dobson ABC made other statutory distributions totaling \$35,838 (Net profit distribution recipients received \$29,447 of this). The amount of \$232,750 in primary distributions and other taxes were paid to the NC Department of Revenue (NCDOR), NC Department of Health & Human Services (NCDHHS), and the county commissioners of Surry County.

Per the local enabling act, the distribution formula for recipients of net profits is as follows:

- Seventy percent (70%) to Dobson General Fund
- Twenty percent (20%) to Dobson General Fund, to be used for law enforcement
- Ten percent (10%) to Dobson General Fund, to be used for parks & recreation

WORKING CAPITAL

G.S. 18B-805(d) allows the board to set aside a portion of the remaining gross receipts, within the limits set by the rules of the Commission, as cash to operate the ABC system. The NC ABC Commission has set a working capital standard for boards with annual gross sales less than \$1.5M an amount equal to four (4) months of sales revenue.

Based upon the existing rules, as of June 30, 2022, the Dobson ABC Board is required to maintain a minimum working capital of \$30,760 with a maximum working capital amount of \$266,585. The Dobson ABC Board had a working capital balance of \$256,629, which falls within the Commission requirements for this section (*).

*** FY 2021-2022: Working Capital (WC) graphic**



Under 18B-805(d), with approval of the appointing authority for the board, the local board may set aside a portion of the remaining gross receipts as a fund for specific capital improvements whenever working capital is exceeded.

PERSONNEL, OPERATIONAL & ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLIANCE

The findings for personnel, operational & administrative compliance are as follows:

- The board holds board meetings the first Tuesday of each month at 5:00 PM, records regular meeting minutes, and provides public notification and awareness of these meetings. The meeting minutes are organized in a folder for review. *The minutes provided do not have the conflict-of-interest disclosure statements referenced and are not routinely signed by the Chairperson.*
 - Training records review: Board members and personnel are compliant on ethics training.
 - Board member compensation & General Manager (GM) salary: Board member compensation fully adheres to statute requirements as does the GM salary.
 - Board website review: The board's login website was updated by the Commission in 2022 for board member term tenure information (*begin dates & end dates*). **Special note**: As part of a revalidation effort, the Commission has worked to revalidate term tenure information for all ABC boards across the state, working directly with the appointing authorities. As a value-added measure for all ABC boards and Commission records tracking in summer 2022, the term begin dates as well as term end dates were entered on all individual ABC board websites.
 - *The expectation going forward is that ABC boards will better manage this information online, and work to communicate with the Commission particularly when new members are added, or whenever any current serving members resign before a term has ended.*
 - Board Personnel & Board Members: The general manager provides board members with monthly sales information and previous year's applicable sales and operational concerns. Board members will rotate for the second signature on checks, and the GM/finance officer continually makes sure financial records are available for review. Board members are heavily encouraged by the Commission to use checks and balances to ensure that cash management practices are upheld; also, boards should routinely review any notes and recommendations provided by the CPA firm on annual audits.
- POLICIES: The Commission does not have a copy of the personnel policy manual. The board adheres to the state travel policy.
- BUDGETS: In FY-2022, the board exceeded budgeted sales in April 2022. While a budget amendment could not be located within Commission records, the CPA audit reflects and validates most of the revised budget increase (and records review showed the board had adopted a budget amendment). *Based on sales trajectory for the current fiscal year, the board exceeded annual budgeted sales in May 2023.*
- FINANCIAL INSIGHT: The GM in a dual role as finance officer is signing checks as required per statute with a board member as secondary signature. Invoice records for recent liquor purchases reflect them as being paid routinely well inside of 30 days. Taxes and distributions are paid in a routine and timely manner. The board uses QuickBooks for routine journal entries.

PERSONNEL, OPERATIONAL & ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLIANCE (cont.)

- Bank deposits are routinely made each business day per review of bank Statements and discussion with the finance officer. For safeguard measures and adherence to *Commission rule 15A .0905 Daily Deposits*, the board utilizes a locked fireproof safe for integrity of funds that remain at the board at any given time.
- Payroll is processed every two weeks through QuickBooks, and paper checks are issued. Board members will alternate review of monthly financial records and signing checks. Paper checks and biweekly.
- The pre-audit certificate is not stamped on the orders at the time they are placed; however, board checks bear the disbursal certificate.
- All board members and applicable personnel are each bonded for \$50,000 per G.S. 18B-700(i).
- The annual CPA audit was received and logged by the Commission on September 30, 2022.

➤ **STATUTORY DISTRIBUTIONS:**

- Net Profit Distributions - The Dobson ABC board has routinely made the minimum mandatory distributions to the designated recipients over the last several years referencing NCGS 18B-805(c)(1). **The table below references distributions calculated by CPA on the left and total net profit distributions made by the ABC Board for the last five (5) years on the right.**
- Law Enforcement Distributions: Have been properly disbursed at the regular 5% statute amount over the last five (5) fiscal years.
- Alcohol Education Distributions: Have been properly disbursed at the regular 7% statute amount. Over the last five (5) fiscal years, this distribution category has been generous averaging 11-12% annually. The Town of Dobson was the recent recipient and they have not provided documentation to the board on how these funds are spent in connection with NCGS 18B-805(h).

NC GENERAL STATUTE: 18B-805 (c)(1)			
Calculation of Minimum Mandatory Distribution for Net Profit to Designated Recipients		Dobson ABC Board Net profit distribution made annually by fiscal year	
<i>Note: Referencing CPA Audit Reports</i>			
CPA Calculated Amount		Total paid to recipient(s)	
FY-2022	\$29,447	FY-2022	\$29,447
FY-2021	\$30,103	FY-2021	\$30,103
FY-2020	\$24,508	FY-2020	\$25,792
FY-2019	\$20,227	FY-2019	\$20,787
FY-2018	\$18,384	FY-2018	\$17,425

PERSONNEL, OPERATIONAL & ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLIANCE (cont.)

- **LAW ENFORCEMENT (LE) REPORTS:** Reports have not been submitted online routinely since March 2018. After discussion with the GM, it was determined that the police department has not routinely been providing enforcement & regulatory data to the board.
- **LAW ENFORCEMENT (LE) CONTRACT:** The Commission has no electronic copy of a law enforcement contract on file, and a copy could not be located during the board visit. The ABC board will be recommended to adopt a new contract with the police department. A new contract should be beneficial to communicate the need for the department to provide enforcement & regulatory data to the ABC board as part of the monthly reporting process.
- **INVENTORY:** Full store inventories are conducted quarterly. In addition, inventory spot checks in certain categories are conducted at random intervals. The inventory turns over moderately well at the store with a 4.9 turnover ratio.
- **INTERNAL CONTROLS:**
 - The board has a full-time employee to support the general manager.
 - The board should consider designating a deputy finance officer to support the GM/finance officer for continuity of operations.
 - Invoice information is entered into QuickBooks, cash requirements are printed for the truck shipments and the Purchase Orders History from BOSS is utilized to balance totals to make sure invoices / inventory match the system.
 - Board members alternate reviewing financial statements and monthly reconciliations.
- **EXPENSES:**
 - Total expenses decreased by roughly fifteen percent (15%) from the last fiscal year.
 - Board payroll was roughly 9.4% of total annual sales. Payroll increased less than one percent (1%) from the previous fiscal year.
 - Cost of Goods Sold (COGS) was around 52.7% for the fiscal year. With the moderate warehouse space, the board has opportunity to continue taking advantage of buy-ins to reasonably reduce liquor costs.

STORE INSIGHT & OVERVIEW

The findings for store insight & overview are as follows:

- Store has a modern layout, good ergonomics for shoppers, and plenty of inventory on the shelves. In 2022, the parking lot was repaved, and a new roof was installed as well as new carpet.
- Sales associate interactions with customers are attentive, courteous, and all are eager to meet the needs of the customers.
- The board has around three (3) MXB customers as of February 2023. None of the business customers are really interested in delivery service. Thus, the board has requested and received an approval waiver from the Commission for a delivery service policy - Referencing Rule 15A . 1903 Delivery of MXB Permittee Orders.
- A random sample of approximately 100 items were selected to determine if uniform pricing is displayed. Of those selected, every item reflected the correct quarterly or monthly SPA price.
- Besides closing on the five (5) required annual holidays and every Sunday, the board opted to close on the day after Christmas 2022.
- The store displays the required Fetal Alcohol Syndrome poster required by G.S. 18B-808. A new poster was provided to replace the older one.
- North Carolina products are cross merchandised according to product category.
- Products are placed within the designated categories; premium products are found at eye-level or top shelf. Some occurrences were found with various bottle sizes of the same products increasing appropriately from left to right. Some other areas had bottle sizes of the same products decreasing in size from left to right. Bottles were fronted and dusted.
- Outside area surrounding the store is well-maintained and free of debris or trash.
- Security systems are in place and functional in all designated areas.
 - *Eight (8) cameras work to cover the property footprint with two outside and six interior cameras.*

RECOMMENDED ACTIONS (PER STATUTES OR COMMISSION RULES)

- ABC Boards are required to operate within a balanced budget each fiscal year. Budget amendments must be approved by the board before any funds are transferred between accounts and utilized, occurring at the actual point of time an adjustment of funds is necessary. This would include the point in time during the fiscal year when the board will exceed its annual forecasted sales budget. *Ensure budget amendment copies are submitted to the ABC Commission as required per NCGS 18B-702(h), to include a final reconciliation budget amendment for the fiscal year end.*
- Please ensure all newly adopted policies or any updated policies are submitted electronically to the Commission for recordkeeping and review per NCAC 15A .1102 Rule. Electronic copies of the personnel manual should be emailed to Commission personnel for recordkeeping.
- The board needs to forward a signed law enforcement contract with Dobson Police Department (or other applicable law enforcement agency) and provide a copy to the Commission *per G.S. 18B-501(f)*.
- Law enforcement reports must be submitted on the Commission's board website by the 7th of each month referencing G.S. 18B-501(f1). Reports should include as applicable the number of arrests made for ABC law, number of agencies assisted with ABC law, and other metrics for ABC law contribution such as compliance checks and alcohol education classes presented. ABC Boards should make sure reports are in a "Final Submitted" status and not just in saved status. For any saved reports, the only transaction necessary is to click the preview button and then click the submit button for the reports.
- Local boards shall establish and maintain a shelf management plan *per Commission Rule 15A .1708 Shelf Management*. The board needs to work to rearrange liquor inventory on the shelves to follow shelf management requirements, in particular ensuring bottles increase in size from left to right.
- Board meeting minutes should have a conflict-of-interest disclosure statement, for proper adherence to G.S. 18B-201 (f)(k) and referencing G.S. 18B-700(h). Currently, no written statement exists on meeting minutes / agendas reviewed for calendar year 2022 to show where the Chairperson / board members are ensuring no conflict of interest is present. Meeting minutes should be routinely signed by Chairperson referencing guidance in Commission's Operations Manual.
- Ensure all purchase orders to include obligations evidenced by a contract or agreement requiring the payment of money, shall include or bear a certificate stating that the instrument (or order) has been pre-audited to ensure compliance with *G.S. 18B-702(m)* with a signature by the finance officer. The specific statement should read, "*This instrument has been pre audited in the manner required by G.S. 18B-702.*" Special note: This would be most reasonably accomplished by signing & stamping the summary total of the Order Edit List from inventory system before any liquor orders are placed with state warehouse.
- In connection with the periodic audit, a Certificate of Accountability attestation form should be reviewed and signed by board members and applicable personnel. A signed copy would then only need to be emailed to Commission personnel for recordkeeping.
- The recipients of alcohol education distributions must provide annual documentation to the board describing the activity for which these awarded funds are spent *per G.S. 18B-805(h)*. *The board may want to consider obtaining documentation before the funds are officially awarded / transmitted to any recipients.*

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS & GUIDANCE

- The Commission's primary focus for ABC board members:
 - ABC board members are highly encouraged to meet monthly for the best formal oversight and review of board operations, routinely recording meeting minutes (*adhering to closed meeting requirements where applicable*) and ensuring either no conflicts of interest are present or that they are addressed appropriately when presented. Monthly sales should be reported to the Commission at beginning of next month, providing annual budgets, budget amendments, miscellaneous financial reporting to Commission following timelines, and ensuring Commission has annual CPA audits by Sept 30th.
 - ABC boards are highly encouraged to keep term begin dates & term end dates updated on the Commission's board login website for all ABC board members and other information such as store hour changes, pictures, email updates, etc. *Moreover, liaising with the Commission when new members are appointed or when member resign early before term has ended is very important for recordkeeping efforts of the Commission.*
- ABC boards are highly encouraged to find straightforward ways to lower any recurring expenses. *A very tangible way to lower operating costs is to fully maximize monthly special purchase allowance (SPA) liquor products that routinely sell well in the store to lower cost of goods sold (COGS).* ABC Boards can limit the number of personnel travelling to conference and convention events across the state. Other ways to try to improve expenses include requesting bids annually from various vendors to get the best rates possible on financial audits, various utilities, maintenance contracts, and *credit card processing companies*.
- ABC boards are encouraged to closely review financial statements monthly, comparing with the annual budget forecast, approving budget amendments when necessary and submitting copies to the Commission for anticipated sales increases as well as other adjustments for budgeted accounts.
- Cross training opportunities for personnel should be maximized to ensure solid continuity of operations occurs for ABC boards. Also, training opportunities can work well to develop store employees for increased responsibility roles and serving to make both the routine operations and employee morale stronger.
- NCAC Rule 15A .1701 requires quarterly reports be submitted for any unsaleable merchandise (breakage) and retain original copies for three (3) years. *All breakage reports should only be transmitted via email submission to Commission staff; copies should not be mailed.*
- As a reminder, remove all faded posters and replace with new ones when applicable. Reach out to the Commission to provide fetal alcohol syndrome posters, NC Dept of Labor can provide wage & hour posters, and OSHA can provide some applicable federal posters if any are needed.
- ABC boards can explore additional training opportunities periodically available through the ABC Commission as well as partnering with other ABC boards on specific areas such as best retail and marketing practices.

Please network with the ABC Commission whenever needed for guidance and assistance to support local ABC board mission and success.

APPENDIX A

Quinn Woolard
ABC Board Auditor
400 E. Tryon Rd.
Raleigh, NC 27610

June 6th, 2023

Dear Mr. Woolard,

The Dobson ABC Board would like to thank you taking the time and showing how we can improve our store. We will work on all the recommended actions you have laid out for us.

1. Do amendments for our budgets and have them sent to ABC Commission.
2. Get a law enforcement contract with Town.
3. Conflict of interest statement before meetings.
4. Purchase orders be signed with a pre audit signature.

Sincerely,

Jon Bledsoe
General Manger
Dobson ABC